# FY 2014-15 STATUS OF LAWSUITS INVOLVING THE STATE OF MICHIGAN



SENATE FISCAL AGENCY LANSING, MICHIGAN JULY 2016

#### THE SENATE FISCAL AGENCY

The Senate Fiscal Agency is governed by a board of five members, including the majority and minority leaders of the Senate, the Chairperson of the Appropriations Committee of the Senate, and two other members of the Appropriations Committee of the Senate appointed by the Chairperson of the Appropriations Committee with the concurrence of the Majority Leader of the Senate, one from the minority party.

The purpose of the Agency, as defined by statute, is to be of service to the Senate Appropriations Committee and other members of the Senate. In accordance with this charge, the Agency strives to achieve the following objectives:

- 1. To provide technical, analytical, and preparatory support for all appropriations bills.
- 2. To provide written analyses of all Senate bills, House bills, and Administrative Rules considered by the Senate.
- 3. To review and evaluate proposed and existing State programs and services.
- 4. To provide economic and revenue analysis and forecasting.
- 5. To review and evaluate the impact of Federal budget decisions on the State.
- 6. To review and evaluate State issuance of long-term and short-term debt.
- 7. To review and evaluate the State's compliance with constitutional and statutory fiscal requirements.
- 8. To prepare special reports on fiscal issues as they arise and at the request of members of the Senate.

The Agency is located on the 8th floor of the Victor Office Center. The Agency is an equal opportunity employer.



Ellen Jeffries, Director
Senate Fiscal Agency
P.O. Box 30036
Lansing, Michigan 48909-7536
Telephone (517) 373-2768
Internet Home Page http://www.senate.michigan.gov/sfa

#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

This report was prepared by Bill Bowerman, Associate Director of the Senate Fiscal Agency General Government Unit. Megan Hyde finalized the report. The Senate Fiscal Agency would like to thank all State departments and agencies for their cooperation.

Any questions regarding this report, or requests for additional copies, should be directed to:

Bill Bowerman Senate Fiscal Agency P.O. Box 30036 Lansing, MI 48909-7536 bbowerman@senate.michigan.gov

Phone: (517) 373-2768

#### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

Overview		1
Table 1	Total Court Judgments and Settlements Paid by the State - FY 2005-06 through FY 2014-15	
Table 2	Court Judgments Paid by the State - FY 2005-06 through FY 2014-15	3
Table 3	Settlements Paid by the State - FY 2005-06 through FY 2014-15	4
Table 4	Departments with Payments over \$1.0 Million	5
Table 5	Highway Negligence Statistics	
Table 6	Risk Management Fund - Automotive Liability Payments	
Table 7	FY 2014-15 Total Court Judgments and Settlements Paid to the State	9
LISTING C	OF CASES RESULTING IN PAYMENTS DURING FY 2014-15	
Attorney G	General	12
Communit	y Health	13
Correction	s	14
Environme	ental Quality	18
	ervices	
Licensing a	and Regulatory Affairs	20
	esources	
	ze	
Talent and	Economic Development	24
Technolog	y, Management, and Budget	25
Transporta	ation	27
Treasury		20

#### **OVERVIEW**

The information in this document is based on reports filed by State departments and agencies pursuant to Section 396(3) of the Management and Budget Act (Public Act 431 of 1984). Based on the amounts reported, the State of Michigan paid \$41.8 million for judgments and settlements in fiscal year (FY) 2014-15. Of the 69 cases that resulted in payments, 12 were judgments totaling \$2.3 million, and 57 were settlements totaling \$39.5 million. Payments in FY 2014-15 were \$28.8 million lower than the \$70.6 million reported in FY 2013-14.

Tables on pages 2, 3, and 4 provide a 10-year history (FY 2005-06 through FY 2014-15) of payments made by the State of Michigan. Table 1 provides information on total payments (judgments and settlements), Table 2 lists payments resulting from judgments only, and Table 3 lists settlements. Table 4 and the following narrative provide a summary of departments with FY 2014-15 payments totaling over \$1.0 million. Table 5 and the narrative on page 6 provide a history of highway negligence payments from FY 1983-84 through FY 2014-15. Table 6 on page 8 includes a history of payments from the State's Risk Management Fund for automotive liability. Payments from the Fund historically have not been included in amounts reported by departments. The Cochran/Nichols case listed by the Department of State Police is an exception to this practice, because the \$7.7 million settlement payment includes \$1.0 million paid from the State's Risk Management Fund. Table 7 and information on pages 9, 10, and 11 provide an overview of cases that resulted in payments to the State.

The FY 2014-15 reports submitted by State departments and agencies on payments made by the State follow, beginning on page 12. For each payment, the name of the case is listed along with information regarding the funding source, the county where the cause of action arose, and a brief description of the cause of action (summary of case). This report does not include payments resulting from workers' compensation and unemployment claims.

Table 1

	TOTAL COURT JUDGMENTS AND SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE (Actual Dollars)										
	Fiscal Year										
DEPARTMENT	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	
Community Health	\$1,428,000	\$800,000	\$2,481,500	\$615,000	\$0	\$365,185	\$338,296	\$916,000	\$1,071,950	\$112,000	
Corrections	904,749	612,097	4,886,697	450,134	14,676,073	10,571,572	15,503,188	20,647,428	22,478,131	26,684,297	
Education	1,163,905	309,441	573,965	455,791	76,458	46,561	49,316	175,000	1,403,678	0	
Human Services	227,007	1,355,000	287,750	6,609,260	1,433,783	1,243,304	572,415	391,498	1,220,731	540,000	
State Police	323,702	1,617,738	2,544,330	31,090	89,529	263,296	711,482	276,900	206,952	7,941,500	
Transportation	743,500	8,466,876	316,000	582,000	2,716,961	230,662	2,538,165	322,900	4,352,879	5,514	
Treasury	254	0	2,046,531	2,087,042	111,752	939,330	55,432,447	62,199,908	34,995,645	1,555,312	
Other Departments	4,647,661	18,633,577	2,664,746	1,019,516	899,865	2,264,453	988,340	709,892	4,866,730	4,922,430	
TOTAL	\$9,438,778	\$31,794,729	\$15,801,519	\$11,849,833	\$20,004,421	\$15,924,363	\$76,133,649	\$85,639,526	\$70,596,696	\$41,761,052	

Table 2

			COURT	JUDGMENTS (Actual	PAID BY THE Dollars)	STATE				
				Fisca	l Year					
DEPARTMENT	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
Community Health	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Corrections	83,881	27,950	4,469	8,287	4,006	41,551	34,656	458,248	3,369	6,082
Education	1,159,905	309,441	210,965	455,791	76,458	46,561	49,316	0	1,348,678	0
Human Services	0	0	0	4,500	9,582	0	0	0	0	0
State Police	0	1,881	383	9,590	15,000	0	1,250	33,000	0	0
Transportation	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	14
Treasury	254	0	46,531	87,042	51,752	550,000	39,397,366	0	2,776,677	408,033
Other Departments	141,477	2,136,175	600	288,212	207,739	159,824	182,062	196,952	2,189,420	1,888,914
TOTAL	\$1,385,517	\$2,475,447	\$262,948	\$853,422	\$364,537	\$797,936	\$39,664,650	\$688,200	\$6,318,144	\$2,303,042

Table 3

			SE		PAID BY THE al Dollars)	STATE						
	Fiscal Year											
DEPARTMENT	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15		
Community Health	\$1,428,000	\$800,000	\$2,481,500	\$615,000	\$0	\$365,185	\$338,296	\$916,000	\$1,071,950	\$112,000		
Corrections	820,868	584,147	4,882,228	441,847	14,672,067	10,530,021	15,468,532	20,189,180	22,474,762	26,678,215		
Education	4,000	0	363,000	0	0	0	0	175,000	55,000	0		
Human Services	227,007	1,355,000	287,750	6,604,760	1,424,201	1,243,304	572,415	391,498	1,220,731	540,000		
State Police	323,702	1,615,857	2,543,947	21,500	74,529	263,296	710,232	243,900	206,952	7,941,500		
Transportation	743,500	8,466,876	316,000	582,000	2,716,961	230,662	2,538,165	322,900	4,352,879	5,500		
Treasury	0	0	2,000,000	2,000,000	60,000	389,330	16,035,081	62,199,908	32,218,968	1,147,279		
Other Departments	4,506,184	16,497,402	2,664,146	731,304	692,126	2,104,629	806,278	512,940	2,677,310	3,033,516		
TOTAL	\$8,053,261	\$29,319,282	\$15,538,571	\$10,996,411	\$19,639,884	\$15,126,427	\$36,468,999	\$84,951,326	\$64,278,552	\$39,458,009		

#### PAYMENTS BY DEPARTMENTS

**TOTAL** 

In FY 2014-15, four State departments each made payments totaling more than \$1.0 million. <u>Table 4</u> and the following narrative summarize these payments.

Table	4							
FY 2014-15								
PAYMENTS BY DI	EPARTMENT							
	STATE	PERCENT OF						
DEPARTMENT	PAYMENTS	TOTAL						
Corrections	\$26,684,297	63.9%						
State Police	7,941,500	19.0						
Technology, Management, & Budget	3,511,332	8.4						
Treasury	1,555,312	3.7						
Other Departments	2,068,611	5.0						

\$41.761.052

100.0%

#### Corrections

The Department of Corrections made payments in 30 cases totaling \$26.7 million, accounting for 63.9% of the payments made by the State in FY 2014-15. Payments ranged from \$42.80 in <u>King v Sanders</u>, for assessed costs in a harassment/retaliation case, to \$25.0 million in <u>Neal</u>, et al. v <u>Department of Corrections</u>, et al., a class action that involved allegations of sexual assault and harassment by male prison guards. The <u>Neal</u> case was filed in 1996. Subsequent to jury verdicts in <u>Neal</u> and a related case, <u>Anderson et al.</u> v <u>Department of Corrections</u>, the State entered into a settlement agreement in 2009 to pay \$100.0 million for class members, costs, and attorney fees, as follows:

October 15, 2009: \$10.0 million

October 15, 2010: \$10.0 million

October 15, 2011: \$15.0 million

October 15, 2012: \$20.0 million

October 15, 2013: \$20.0 million

October 15, 2014: \$25.0 million

There were a total of 806 claimants who qualified for payments under the class action settlement. At the time of the settlement, 677 of the claimants were not in the custody of the State Department of Corrections and 129 were still incarcerated. After the <u>Neal</u> payment, the next-highest payment by the Department was \$925,000 in <u>Montgomery</u> v <u>MDOC</u>, a case alleging employee discrimination based on race and disability. Of the 30 cases with payments, 20 had payments of less than \$10,000.

#### State Police

The Department of State Police made payments in five cases totaling \$7.9 million. Payments ranged from \$29,500 in Woods v Roth, et al., a case involving alleged assault and battery, to \$7.7 million in Cochran/Nichols v Fagin/MSP. The Cochran/Nichols case involved wrongful death and personal injury that arose out of a two-vehicle collision occurring on July 3, 2014, in the City of Flint. A state trooper attempted to stop a motorist for a traffic violation and when the suspect vehicle sped away, the trooper pursued the vehicle and subsequently ran a red light, broad-siding another vehicle and killing one of its passengers and critically injuring another.

#### Technology, Management, and Budget

Payments by the Department of Technology, Management, and Budget (DTMB) in four cases totaled \$3.5 million. The largest payment was \$1.8 million for the <u>DeBoer</u> freedom-to-marry case. In addition, the Department of Attorney General reported paying \$108,620 in <u>DeBoer</u> attorney fees (<u>Stanyar</u>). The next-highest payment by the DTMB was \$950,000 in <u>Basset</u> v <u>Snyder</u>, a lawsuit asking a Federal court to strike down a State law that banned many public entities from providing health care insurance to the domestic partners of their employees.

#### **Treasury**

Specific information prohibited from disclosure based on MCL 205.28(1)(f).

#### Highway Negligence Cases

From FY 1983-84 through FY 2014-15, the State paid \$236.7 million resulting from 1,174 highway negligence cases. While total payments and the number of cases resulting from highway negligence litigation have declined dramatically over recent years, FY 2013-14 was the first year in which no payments resulted from defective highway claims. In FY 2014-15, there was one payment of \$5,500 for a case involving a pedestrian who allegedly was crossing M-153 when she fell through a broken catch basin and suffered injuries. Of the total amount paid for highway negligence cases since FY 1983-84, \$225.4 million was paid before FY 2000-01. The reduction in payments over the years is attributed to statutory changes (tort reform) and rulings by the Michigan Supreme Court that limited the State's exposure to liability. Table 5 provides a history of highway negligence payments by fiscal year from FY 1983-84 through FY 2014-15.

Table 5

	HIGHW	AY NEGLIGENCE S	STATISTICS	
	NUMBER			TOTAL
FISCAL YEAR	OF CASES	JUDGMENTS	SETTLEMENTS	PAYMENTS
1983-84	62	\$12,541,651	\$2,444,976	\$14,986,627
1984-85	55	4,399,001	4,128,751	8,527,752
1985-86	64	3,242,143	4,347,140	7,589,283
1986-87	69	22,699,603	4,151,959	26,851,562
1987-88	81	5,195,041	10,897,265	16,092,306
1988-89	90	2,869,944	12,151,689	15,021,633
1989-90	86	8,908,886	8,460,458	17,369,344
1990-91	83	10,043,560	10,353,328	20,396,888
1991-92	93	6,018,686	6,606,453	12,625,139
1992-93	70	11,290,468	8,968,167	20,258,635
1993-94	79	5,107,256	7,472,542	12,579,798
1994-95	47	1,871,956	8,010,456	9,882,412
1995-96	52	661,000	8,413,595	9,074,595
1996-97	50	1,331,974	9,679,852	11,011,826
1997-98	39	0	6,084,715	6,084,715
1998-99	33	0	4,721,422	4,721,422
1999-2000	34	2,875,000	9,461,500	12,336,500
2000-01	12	0	668,400	668,400
2001-02	14	0	1,222,240	1,222,240
2002-03	10	0	458,500	458,500
2003-04	12	0	1,521,200	1,521,200
2004-05	10	0	1,443,250	1,443,250
2005-06	9	0	614,000	614,000
2006-07	6	0	1,327,776	1,327,776
2007-08	4	0	246,000	246,000
2008-09	2	0	520,000	520,000
2009-10	1	0	2,500,000	2,500,000
2010-11	1	0	10,000	10,000
2011-12	2	0	679,000	679,000
2012-13	3	0	122,900	122,900
2013-14	0	0	0	0
2014-15	1	0	5,500	5,500
TOTAL	1,174	\$99,056,169	\$137,693,034	\$236,749,203
	Department of Tra		· · · ·	· · ·

#### **RISK MANAGEMENT FUND**

The Risk Management Fund was administratively established to account for specific centralized risk management functions performed for all State agencies by the Department of Management and Budget (now the Department of Technology, Management, and Budget). Effective July 1, 1992, the State became self-insured for automotive liability claims. Motor transport charges to State departments and agencies include a cost associated with projected automotive liability. This amount is deposited in the State's Risk Management Fund. Automotive liability payments that do not exceed \$1.0 million are paid from the Fund. Table 6 provides a history of payments from the Fund. Amounts are reported based on the fiscal year in which the payment was made, and therefore do not necessarily reflect the year in which the liability occurred.

Table 6

	RISK MANAGEMENT FUND										
AUTOMOTIVE LIABILITY PAYMENTS											
FY 1991-92	\$28,318	FY 2003-04	\$2,718,182								
FY 1992-93	\$138,194	FY 2004-05	\$2,941,684								
FY 1993-94	\$435,862	FY 2005-06	\$1,457,041								
FY 1994-95	\$1,135,659	FY 2006-07	\$2,506,962								
FY 1995-96	\$1,977,178	FY 2007-08	\$1,316,613								
FY 1996-97	\$1,743,580	FY 2008-09	\$1,432,166								
FY 1997-98	\$1,223,622	FY 2009-10	\$863,269								
FY 1998-99	\$3,985,189	FY 2010-11	\$798,449								
FY 1999-2000	\$775,972	FY 2011-12	\$1,840,225								
FY 2000-01	\$2,590,458	FY 2012-13	\$188,624								
FY 2001-02	\$1,780,009	FY 2013-14	\$464,963								
FY 2002-03	\$2,487,429	FY 2014-15	\$1,903,191								

#### PAYMENTS TO THE STATE OF MICHIGAN

The following table provides a summary of FY 2014-15 lawsuit payments to the State as reported by departments pursuant to Section 396(3) of the Management and Budget Act.

Table 7

Table 1						
FY 2014-15 JUDGMENTS AND SETTLEMENTS PAID TO THE STATE						
(Actual Dolla	ars)					
DEPARTMENT	FY 2014-15					
Attorney General	\$203,065,755.51					
Corrections	2,874,948.50					
Environmental Quality	5,248,517.36					
Human Services	564,315.52					
Natural Resources	5,894,959.95					
Transportation	202,481.04					
Treasury	60,775,747.54					
TOTAL	\$278,626,725.42					

#### **Attorney General**

Of the amount reported by the Department of Attorney General, approximately \$190.9 million resulted from annual payments under the Master Settlement Agreement. The 1998 settlement resolved public health-related claims filed by Michigan and other states against the nation's major tobacco companies. The total FY 2014-15 amount received by the State under the Master Settlement Agreement (as reported by the Department of Treasury) was \$251.6 million. The difference between that amount and the amount reported by the Department of Attorney General is accounted for under payments to the Department of Treasury (\$60.7 million) and is due to securitization of a portion of the payments owed to the State. The next-largest payment to the Department of Attorney General was \$3.2 million in Chase Bank, USA NA & Chase Bankcard Services, Inc., a case involving unlawful credit card debt collection practices. The Consumer Protection Division collected \$6.6 million in FY 2014-15, including the Chase payment. Other divisions reporting large collections included: Corporate Oversight, \$2.2 million; and Health Care Fraud, \$2.2 million.

Payments reported by the Department of Attorney General only include lawsuit proceeds deposited into the State Treasury by the Attorney General. They do not include lawsuit proceeds deposited in the State Treasury by other State agencies.

#### Corrections

All of the payments listed by the Department of Corrections resulted from cases filed under the State Correctional Facility Reimbursement Act. The Department reported 292 cases with net payments to the State totaling \$2.9 million. Payments to the State ranged from \$2.28 to \$141,605. There were 202 cases with payments of less than \$10,000, accounting for \$688,037 (23.9%) of FY 2014-15 total payments to the State received by the

Department. Thirty-six cases with payments of \$20,000 or more accounted for \$1.4 million (48.4%) of the amount recovered by the Department of Corrections. The median payment was \$5,150. Pursuant to Section 309 of the FY 2014-15 General Government appropriation act (Article VIII of Public Act 252 of 2014), the Department of Attorney General received an appropriation of \$614,400 from the prisoner reimbursement funds to support activities related to the State Correctional Facility Reimbursement Act. In addition, this appropriation act specified that, if the Department of Attorney General collected in excess of \$1,131,000 in gross annual prisoner reimbursement receipts provided to the General Fund, the excess, up to a maximum of \$1.0 million, was appropriated to the Department of Attorney General and could be spent on the representation of the Department of Corrections and its officers, employees, and agents, including, but not limited to, the defense of litigation against the State, its departments, officers, employees, or agents in civil actions filed by prisoners.

#### **Environmental Quality**

The \$5.2 million received by the Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) in FY 2014-15 involved reimbursement for environmental contamination and other violations of the Natural Resources and Environmental Protection Act. Recoveries in those cases were deposited into various funds (e.g., the Environmental Response Fund, Environmental Pollution Prevention Fund, and Settlement Fund). Settlement revenue is restricted by legal agreements or court orders for specific environmental cleanup activities at specific sites of environmental contamination or restricted to other environmental programs as appropriated. Of the 193 cases reported by the DEQ, 38 were judgments totaling \$1.5 million, and 155 were settlements or the result of other agreements totaling \$3.7 million. There were 119 cases with payments of less than \$10,000 that totaled \$339,309. Nine cases with payments over \$100,000 accounted for \$3.0 million (56.6%) of payments received by the DEQ in FY 2014-15.

The largest payment reported was \$1.0 million in <u>Enbridge Energy</u> for a violation of Part 201 (Environmental Remediation) of the Act. For several years the State has received payments from Enbridge, including payments to the DEQ, the Department of Attorney General, and the Department of Natural Resources (DNR). A \$5.0 million Enbridge payment to the DNR was included in FY 2014-15 (described below). From October 2011 through February 2016, the State collected \$17.4 million from Enbridge. The next-highest payment to the State was \$677,003 in <u>AK Steel Corporation</u> for a Part 55 (Air Pollution Control) violation.

#### **Natural Resources**

In FY 2014-15, the Department of Natural Resources reported six cases with payments to the State totaling \$5.9 million. Of that amount, \$5.0 million was from the settlement agreement in <a href="Enbridge Energy">Enbridge Energy</a> for damage to fisheries related to the July 2010 release of heavy crude oil to the Talmadge Creek and the Kalamazoo River. The two next-highest payments received by the DNR both involved Consumers Energy and payments for damage to fisheries. One case involved an administrative consent order payment of \$436,231 for restitution related to the lost value of fish caused by the Karn-Weadock Power Plant. The other payment was \$432,856 for <a href="MDNR">MDNR</a>, et al. v <a href="Consumers Energy">Consumers Energy</a>, a multiyear settlement with Consumers Energy for fisheries damage from hydropower operations. The Fisheries Settlement Fund was established to receive payments by Consumers. Under the settlement, payments will continue through 2035. Settlement funds are earmarked and subsequently used for habitat mitigation work in the area or watershed where the violation occurred. Since 1995, payments by Consumers have totaled \$12.7 million.

#### **Transportation**

Payments to the Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT) included 24 cases totaling \$202,481. Nineteen cases alleging damage to bridges, guardrails, traffic signals, signs, and other State property resulted in payments totaling \$130,639. The other five cases consisted of issues involving contract disputes, encroachment on State right-of-way, illegal cutting of trees, and adverse possession. Fiscal year 2014-15 payments to MDOT ranged from \$200 for damage to MDOT's traffic signal control box on Kalamazoo Avenue in Kalamazoo, to \$45,144 for damage to MDOT's bridge on I-69 at South Lapeer Road.

#### Treasury

The Department of Treasury reported payments of \$251.7 million related to the <u>Master Settlement Agreement</u> with the tobacco companies. To avoid double-counting due to the amount reported by the Department of Attorney General for that case, the amount listed under Department of Treasury in <u>Table 6</u> reflects only the \$60.7 million allocated for debt service on the securitized portion of the <u>Master Settlement Agreement</u> revenue. The only other payment to the State reported by the Department of Treasury was \$52,469.79 in proceeds from the closure of an insurance company.

**DEPARTMENT: ATTORNEY GENERAL** 

## FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Laura Cook	\$57,500.00	\$0	Litigation Expense Reimbursement Fund	Ingham	Settlement for physical injury.
Caspar v Snyder	225,000.00	0	Litigation Expense Reimbursement Fund	Wayne	Attorney fees & costs paid for challenging validity of same sex marriage.
Matthew Makowski v Governor of Michigan	1,393.71	0	General Fund	Ingham	Costs regarding rescinding commutation.
Carol A. Stanyar	108,620.00	0	Litigation Expense Reimbursement Fund	Wayne	DeBoer attorney fees.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$392,513.71 \$0

**DEPARTMENT: COMMUNITY HEALTH** 

# FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE - Expenses

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
_aronda Chastang v MDCH	\$42,500.00	\$0	General Fund	Wayne	Harassment/Discrimination settlement and attorney fee
McCord v DCH	18,000.00	0	General Fund	Ingham	Civil Service settlement and attorney fee.
Elizabeth L Milton v MDCH	30,000.00	0	General Fund	Wayne	Age discrimination settlement and attorney fee.
Nicole M Huby v MDCH	15,000.00	0	General Fund	Washtenaw	Sexual harassment discrimination settlement.
Williams v DCH	3,500.00	0	General Fund	Genesee	Civil rights settlement agreement.
Khan v DCH	3,000.00	0	General Fund	Genesee	Office of Inspector General investigation settlement agreement.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$112,000.00 \$0

**DEPARTMENT: CORRECTIONS** 

## FORM 1: JUDGMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Betty, Rodriguez v MDOC	\$62.04	\$0	General Fund	Ionia	Petition for Review: Costs assessed as a result of petitioner's successful appeal of misconduct guilty finding.
Heard, Lamont, et al v Thomas Finco, et al	1,000.00	0	General Fund	Branch	Religion - Sanctions assessed due to failure to meet court-ordered minimum daily caloric requirement during Ramadan.
Hunt, Milton v MDOC	287.59	0	General Fund	Alger	Petition for Review: Costs assessed as a result of petitioner's successful appeal of misconduct guilty finding.
Jarrett, Michael v MDOC	375.00	0	General Fund	Manistee	Petition for Review: Costs assessed as a result of petitioner's successful appeal of misconduct guilty finding.
King, Cheryl & Kevin v Tiffaney Williams	4,128.30	0	General Fund	Jackson	Visits: Plaintiffs alleged they were harassed by defendant during a visit.
King, Kevin v Terry Sanders	42.80	0	General Fund	Jackson	Harassment/Retaliation: Costs assessed as a result of plaintiff's motion to compel production of documents being granted by court.
Pickelhaupt, David v MDOC	186.00	0	General Fund	Saginaw	Petition for Review: Costs assessed as a result of petitioner's successful appeal of misconduct guilty finding.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$6,081.73 \$0

**DEPARTMENT: CORRECTIONS** 

# FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Allen, Deshawn Steve v Tommy Lickman, et al	\$2,000.00	\$0	General Fund	Gratiot	Conditions of Confinement: Plaintiff alleged defendants retaliated against him after he struck one of the defendants.
Bennett, Willie v MDOC	2,000.00	0	General Fund	Wayne	Use of Force: Plaintiff alleged he was threatened with transfer if he did not engage in sexual activity.
Boyer, Kathy, et al v MDOC, et al	60,000.00	0	General Fund	Washtenaw	Medical: Plaintiff alleged she sustained injuries when she fell from her top bunk and did not receive timely medical care, resulting in permanent injury.
Clark, Patrick, et al v MDOC, et al	290,000.00	0	General Fund	Washtenaw	Employee-Discrimination: Plaintiffs alleged they were discriminated against based on race and engagement in protected activity under ELCRA.
Clay, Elroy v Charles Coy, et al	600.00	0	General Fund	Livingston	Use of Force: Plaintiff alleged that he was subjected to excessive use of force.
Dunham, Russell v Dr. Malik, et al	5,000.00	0	General Fund	Ingham	Medical: Plaintiff alleged inadequate medical treatment for his knee injury.
Dye, David v Kenneth E. Hatfield, et al	4,000.00	0	General Fund	Ingham	Use of Force: Plaintiff alleged excessive force used in his apprehension.
Hall, George v Michael Martin, et al	20,000.00	0	General Fund	Branch	Religion: Plaintiff alleged his religious dietary needs were not accommodated.
Lyons, Steven v Gayle Leach, et al	1,000.00	0	General Fund	Macomb	Harassment/Retaliation: Plaintiff alleged he was terminated from his library assignment as an act of retaliation because he filed a complaint about working conditions.
McCaskill, DeAndre v Kenneth Dettloff	550.00	0	General Fund	Jackson	Harassment/Retaliation: Plaintiff alleged defendant retaliated against him for plaintiff filing a complaint against the defendant.

**DEPARTMENT: CORRECTIONS** 

# FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Mitchell, Matthew v MDOC	65,000.00	0	General Fund	Cass	Employee - Other: Plaintiff alleged sexual harassment and retaliation.
Montgomery, John v MDOC	925,000.00	0	General Fund	Wayne	Employee-Discrimination: Plaintiff claimed disparate treatment based on race and disability.
Murphy, Timothy v Lori Bonn	4,000.00	0	General Fund	Ionia	Medical: Plaintiff alleged he was not given a bottom bunk per his medical detail and subsequently fell off the top bunk, injuring his shoulder.
Muthana, Ali v Daniel Heyns	45,000.00	0	General Fund	Marquette	Mail: Plaintiff challenged MDOC policy allowing for rejection of correspondence written in a foreign language.
Neal, et al v MDOC, et al AY 13:	25,000,000.00 12,385.78	0	General Fund	Statewide	Failure to Protect - Prisoners: Sixth of 6 installment payments to be made 10/15/09-10/2014.
Neal, et al v MDOC/Anderson, et al v MDOC, et al	1,829.00	0	General Fund	Washtenaw	Failure to Protect - Prisoners: Payment to Special Master for services rendered 12/3/13 through 10/08/14.
Olson, William B. v Patricia Caruso, et al	8,350.00	0	General Fund	Jackson	Medical: Plaintiff alleged defendants refused to refer him to health care for treatment of his chest pains.
Pasley, Lynne T. v Kandy Elkins, et al	500.00	0	General Fund	Ingham	Medical: Plaintiff alleged he received inadequate medical care at various institutions.
Shamblen, David v Ronald Embry, et al	6,500.00	0	General Fund	Ionia	Failure to Protect - Prisoner: Plaintiff alleged information he provided regarding another prisoner was disclosed to that prisoner resulting in plaintiff's assault.
Sildack, Trenton v Corizon Health, Inc, et al	25,000.00	0	General Fund	Ingham	Medical: Plaintiff alleged inadequate medical treatment for a back injury.

**DEPARTMENT: CORRECTIONS** 

## FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Warren, Christine Ann, Pers Rep for the Estate of Carnell Warren v Lisa Ann Shilling, R.N.	125,000.00	0	General Fund	Ingham	Medical: Plaintiff alleged prisoner's death was due to lack of appropriate medical care.
Williamson, Rodney v Randall Haas, et al	2,000.00	0	General Fund	Macomb	Retaliation: Plaintiff alleged he was transferred in retaliation for filing a grievance.
Woodward, Christine v MDOC	72,500.00	0	General Fund	Montcalm	Employee-Discrimination: Plaintiff alleged sex discrimination and retaliation under ELCRA and the Civil Rights Act of 1964.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$26,678,214.78 \$0

**DEPARTMENT: ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY** 

# FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Jentz-Pflanzer	\$25,000.00	\$0	Settlement Fund	Sanilac	Part 303, Part 301, Part 31, and Part 91

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$25,000.00

**\$0** 

**DEPARTMENT:** HUMAN SERVICES

## FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Dwayne B. v DHHS	\$310,000.00	\$0	General Fund	Statewide	Attorney fees; Class Action Lawsuit re: MI foster care system.
Falcon-Eggert, Victoria v DHHS	110,000.00	0	General Fund	St. Clair	Lawsuit alleging employee discrimination.
Owensby, Malikah v DHHS	15,000.00	0	General Fund	Kalamazoo	Lawsuit alleging employee discrimination.
Barry, Walter, et al v Nick Lyon	105,000.00	0	General Fund	Statewide	Attorney fees.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$540,000.00 \$0

**DEPARTMENT: LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS** 

## FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Flying Dog Brewery, LLLP v. Michigan Liquor Control Comm	140,000.00	0	Liquor Purchase Revolving Fund	Statewide	First amendment civil rights case under USC 1983.
Judy Seldin and Karen Gottschalk v Department of Licensing and Regulatory Affairs	45,596.39	0	Health Professions Regulatory Fund	Washtenaw	Dispute about practicing psychology without a license or under the supervision of a licensed psychologist.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$185,596.39 \$0

**DEPARTMENT: NATURAL RESOURCES** 

## FORM 1: JUDGMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Platte Lake Improvement Assoc. v DNR	\$88,914.00	\$0	Game & Fish Protection Fund	Benzie	Support of court-appointed expert pursuant to consent judgment dated March 10, 2000, regarding effluent discharge from State hatchery.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$88,914.00 \$0

**DEPARTMENT: NATURAL RESOURCES** 

## FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Pratt, Drain Commissioners v DNR (Judgment entered 12/19/14)	\$83,073.70	\$0	General Fund	Berrien, Gladwin, Livingston, Mecosta, Newaygo, Oakland, Presque Isle, Washtenaw	Lake Level Assessments 2004-2012.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$83,073.70 \$0

**DEPARTMENT: STATE POLICE** 

## FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Woods v Roth, et al.	\$29,500.00	\$0	General Fund	Genesee	Plaintiff alleged assault & battery.
Briceno v MSP, et al.	47,000.00	0	General Fund	Wayne	Plaintiff alleged unlawful detention.
Lafata v MSP, et al.	95,000.00	0	General Fund	Ingham	Plaintiff alleged retaliation.
Gerbig v Witt, et al.	45,000.00	0	General Fund	Gogebic	Plaintiff alleged assault & battery.
Cochran/Nichols v Fagin/MSP	7,725,000.00	0	General Fund (\$6,725,000) Risk Management Fund (\$1,000,000)	Genesee	Fatal vehicle accident involving patrol car.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$7,941,500.00 \$0

**DEPARTMENT:** TALENT AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

## FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
City of Hamtramck v Beal Properties, LLC	\$571,000.00	\$0	Michigan State Housing Development Authority*	Wayne	Beal entered into a Developer Agreement with City of Hamtramck in October 2011 as part of the City's Neighborhood Stabilization Program-II (NSP2) program. After liens were filed by the unpaid subcontractors, payments to Beal were suspended and unspent NSP2 funds for the Beal project were recaptured/de-obligated in October 2012. The City brought suit against Beal in November 2012 seeking, among other things, transfer of title to the properties from Beal to City Beal counterclaimed for payment of the suspended/withheld payments. On November 2013, the trial court entered a money judgment in favor of Beal for \$571,000, with the disposition of title to the 11 properties to be determined at a later date. City could not pay the judgment and title to these properties was with Beal. Beal filed a motion seeking an order allowing Beal the use and disposition of the 11 properties. MSHDA interceded to ensure development of the properties in a manner consistent with HUD requirements and avoid risk of recapture of NSP funds for failure to achieve a national objective.
Community 1 <sup>st</sup> - Mitchell Street LLC v MSHDA	65,000.00	0	Michigan State Housing Development Authority*	Wayne	Community 1st Mitchell Street LLC filed a lawsuit alleging breach of contract in connection with MSHDA's refusal to allow interest on a promissory note as a reimbursable expense under the Neighborhood Stabilization Program-II (NSP2).
FY 2014-15 TOTAL:	\$636,000.00	\$0			*Funds of the Michigan State Housing Development Authority are not funds of the State

**DEPARTMENT: TECHNOLOGY, MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET** 

## FORM 1: JUDGMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
DeBoer Settlement	\$1,800,000.00	\$0	General Fund	Statewide	Freedom to marry.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$1,800,000.00 \$0

**DEPARTMENT: TECHNOLOGY, MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET** 

## FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Detroit Chapter 9 Bankruptcy	\$671,332.00	\$0	General Fund	Wayne	Chapter 9 Bankruptcy - Attorney Fees.
Retired Detroit Police Members Association	90,000.00	0	General Fund	Wayne	Settlement payment to the Retired Detroit Police Members Association.
Basset v Snyder	950,000.00	0	General Fund	Statewide	Public Employee Domestic Partner Restriction Act.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$1,711,332.00 \$0

**DEPARTMENT:** TRANSPORTATION

EODM 1.	<b>JUDGMENTS</b>	DAID BY	THE STA	TE
FURIN I	JUDGINENIS	PAID DI	IDESIA	

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
MDOT v Brian's Auto Parts	\$13.70	\$0	State Trunkline Fund	Manistee	Encroachment upon MDOT's right of way adjacent to US-31 near Stronach Road in Manistee.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$13.70 \$0

**DEPARTMENT:** TRANSPORTATION

## FORM 2: SETTLEMENTS PAID BY THE STATE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Nichole Lowe v MDOT	\$5,500.00	\$0	State Trunkline Fund	Wayne	Plaintiff alleged defect in catch basin on Ford Road near Belmont Street in Dearborn Heights caused her to fall through the basin and suffer severe injuries.

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$5,500.00 \$0

**DEPARTMENT:** TREASURY

FORM 1: JUDGMENTS PAID BY THE STATE					
NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Tax refund cases	\$408,032.84	\$0	General Fund		Specific information prohibited from disclosure based on MCL 205.28(1)(f).

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$408,032.84 \$0

**DEPARTMENT:** TREASURY

	OFT.	CRACLITO	DAID	DV TIII	
FORM 2:	SELLL	LEMENIS	PAID	RA IH	ESIAIE

NAME OF CASE	AMOUNT PAID	INTEREST	FUNDING SOURCE	LOCATION	SUMMARY OF CASE
Tax refund cases	\$1,147,278.74	\$61.50	General Fund		Specific information prohibited from disclosure based on MCL 205.28(1)(f).

FY 2014-15 TOTAL: \$1,147,278.74 \$61.50